Network Working Group Request for Comments: 3055 Category: Standards Track M. Krishnaswamy Photuris, Inc. D. Romascanu Avaya Communication February 2001

Management Information Base for the PINT Services Architecture

Status of this Memo

This document specifies an Internet standards track protocol for the Internet community, and requests discussion and suggestions for improvements. Please refer to the current edition of the "Internet Official Protocol Standards" (STD 1) for the standardization state and status of this protocol. Distribution of this memo is unlimited.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (C) The Internet Society (2001). All Rights Reserved.

Abstract

This memo describes a proposed Management Information Base (MIB) for the PSTN/Internet Interworking (PINT) Services Architecture.

Table of Contents

	Introduction	
2.	The SNMP Management Framework	2
3.	The need for PINT Services monitoring MIB	
	PINT MIB Overview	
	Definitions	
6.	Acknowledgements	17
7.	Security Considerations	17
8.	IANA Considerations	
	Intellectual Property	
10.	References	18
	Authors' Addresses	
12.	Full Copyright Statement	21

1. Introduction

PINT services are an emerging set of new Internet based applications where voice (and fax) requests to the PSTN (Public Switched Telephone Network) are carried over the Internet. RFC 2458 [1] gives a good introduction to the (pre-standard) PINT architecture and services. It also has examples of some of the early implementations of pre-PINT.

This document defines a MIB which contains the elements for monitoring the performance of a PINT based service. The MIB consists of details of the four basic PINT services and their performance statistics measured under various criteria.

It is not the purpose of this MIB to enable management of the PINT networking elements. We are concerned only with the PINT specific performance parameters. While it is understood that PINT service performance is closely related to host and network performance, they are not addressed here.

2. The SNMP Management Framework

The SNMP Management Framework presently consists of five major components:

- o An overall architecture, described in RFC 2571 [2].
- Mechanisms for describing and naming objects and events for the purpose of management. The first version of this Structure of Management Information (SMI) is called SMIv1 and described in STD 16, RFC 1155 [3], STD 16, RFC 1212 [4] and RFC 1215 [5]. The second version, called SMIv2, is described in STD 58, RFC 2578 [6], RFC 2579 [7] and RFC 2580 [8].
- Message protocols for transferring management information. The first version of the SNMP message protocol is called SNMPv1 and described in STD 15, RFC 1157 [9]. A second version of the SNMP message protocol, which is not an Internet standards track protocol, is called SNMPv2c and described in RFC 1901 [10] and RFC 1906 [11]. The third version of the message protocol is called SNMPv3 and described in RFC 1906 [11], RFC 2572 [12] and RFC 2574 [13].
- Protocol operations for accessing management information. The first set of protocol operations and associated PDU formats is described in STD 15, RFC 1157 [9]. A second set of protocol operations and associated PDU formats is described in RFC 1905 [14].

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 2]

 A set of fundamental applications described in RFC 2573 [15] and the view-based access control mechanism described in RFC 2575 [16].

A more detailed introduction to the current SNMP Management Framework can be found in RFC 2570 [17].

Managed objects are accessed via a virtual information store, termed the Management Information Base or MIB. Objects in the MIB are defined using the mechanisms defined in the SMI.

This memo specifies a MIB module that is compliant to the SMIv2. A MIB conforming to the SMIv1 can be produced through the appropriate translations. The resulting translated MIB must be semantically equivalent, except where objects or events are omitted because no translation is possible (use of Counter64). Some machine-readable information in SMIv2 will be converted into textual descriptions in SMIv1 during the translation process. However, this loss of machine readable information is not considered to change the semantics of the MIB.

3. The need for PINT services monitoring MIB

Traditionally voice (and fax) requests originate and terminate inside a PSTN network. This network is well known for robust handling of the requests, in terms of availability and security. However when the requests originate from the Internet there is a concern both on the part of the user as well as the provider about issues like reliable forwarding of the call requests to the PINT gateway under various network conditions, user/host authentication, secure handling of the user information etc. Performance and security management becomes all the more important where PINT services cross multiple administrative domains (or providers).

This MIB is an attempt to list the parameters that need to be monitored on an user, PINT client, PINT server and PINT gateway basis.

(PINT services, their invocation methods/protocols and security issues associated with the PINT architecture are discussed in detail in [18]).

4. PINT MIB - Overview

Following is a list of some explanations on the MIB definitions that we have chosen to construct.

- o The basic purpose of this MIB is to monitor the access to PINT services both from the performance and security point of view. Information may pertain to a certain user or his/her system (PINT client) or the system providing the PINT services (PINT server) or the PINT gateway that forwards the call to the PSTN network.
- We chose to build the configuration table as an extension of the Application MIB - RFC 2287 [19] using the augments construct. Server location and contact might be retrieved from the standard MIB-II sysLocation and sysContact objects. There is no need to replicate this information in the PINT MIB. However, the PINT administrator may be a different person than the sysadmin with global responsibilities, thus a pintSysContact object is defined.
- We chose to monitor the gateway connections from the PINT server. While the agent runs in the PINT servers, the connections to the gateways might need to be monitored in order to understand what goes on. We placed them in a separate MIB group, and by using MODULE-COMPLIANCE clauses, agents that cannot implement this stuff will not be mandated to do it.
- o There is no traps definition in this MIB module. Note that thresholding on counters is always possible by using a standard mechanism defined by the Remote Monitoring MIB, that can be referenced here. Some events that may be defined by using this mechanisms:
 - * continuous login/authentication failure or refusal from a particular client or user
 - * nuisance call repeated calls (within a specified period) to a number originating from the same user
- o The client performance and user performance tables may be rather resource demanding for an agent implementation. In some MIBs, like the Remote Monitoring (RMON) MIBs, control mechanisms were built in order to activate those statistics on demand. If needed, a sorting ('topN') mechanism can be designed, so that a sorted view of clients or users is presented for the high level debugging.

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 4]

- We built a time-distribution trying to cover both short-lived, as well as longer sessions (1-10 secs, 10 secs - 1 min., 1-15 min., 15 mins-24 hours, longer).
- PintServerClientAddress is defined as a SnmpAdminString. It may include an IpAddress and/or name, but we preferred to minimize the number of indices at this stage, and keep a human-readable format at the same time.
- We define pintServerUserIdName as the UserId. This UserId needs to be unique across multiple PINT servers and gateways (depending on the architecture) and is mapped to the SessionId. One way to achieve this uniqueness is by appending clientId to the UserId string before sending to the PINT server. The SessionId could then be a combination of this new UserId and a timestamp.
- 5. Definitions

PINT-MIB DEFINITIONS ::= BEGIN

IMPORTS OBJECT-TYPE, Counter32, MODULE-IDENTITY, mib-2 FROM SNMPv2-SMI TEXTUAL-CONVENTION FROM SNMPv2-TC MODULE-COMPLIANCE, OBJECT-GROUP FROM SNMPv2-CONF sysApplInstallPkgEntry FROM SYSAPPL-MIB SnmpAdminString FROM SNMP-FRAMEWORK-MIB; -- RFC 2571 [2]

pintMib MODULE-IDENTITY LAST-UPDATED "2001020100002" -- 1 Feb 2001

ORGANIZATION "IETF PINT Working Group" CONTACT-INFO " Chairs: Steve Bellovin E-mail: smb@research.att.com

> Igor Faynberg E-mail: faynberg@lucent.com

Authors: Murali Krishnaswamy Postal: 20 Corporate Place South Piscataway, NJ 08854 Tel: +1 (732)465-1000

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 5]

E-mail: murali@photuris.com Dan Romascanu Postal: Atidim Technology Park, Bldg 3 Tel Aviv, Israel Tel: +972 3 6458414 E-mail: dromasca@avaya.com General Discussion:pint@lists.bell-labs.com To Subscribe: pint-request@lists.bell-labs.com In Body: subscribe your-email-addres Archive: http://www.bell-labs.com/mailing-lists/pint/ DESCRIPTION "This MIB defines the objects necessary to monitor PINT Services" -- Revision history REVISION "200102010000Z" -- 1 Feb 2001 DESCRIPTION "Initial version, published as RFC 3055." ::= { mib-2 93 } PintServiceType ::= TEXTUAL-CONVENTION STATUS current DESCRIPTION "This TC describes the type of a PINT service." SYNTAX INTEGER { r2C(1), -- Request-to-Tall r2F(2), -- Request-to-Fax -- Request-to-Talk r2FB(3), -- Request-to-Fax-Back r2HC(4) -- Request-to-Hear-Content } PintPerfStatPeriod ::= TEXTUAL-CONVENTION STATUS current DESCRIPTION "This TC describes the statistics period of time. Note that the values of the counters indexed with a value SinceReboot(4) can be potentially affected by a counter rollover. It is the responsibility of the application using this object to take into account that the counter has been zeroed each time it reached a value of (2**32-1)." SYNTAX INTEGER { last30sec(1), -- Performance Statics for the last 30 sec

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 6]

last15min(2), -- 15 min last24Hr(3), -- 24 Hour sinceReboot(4) -- Since the time the pint server was last rebooted } pintServerConfigOBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { pintMib 1 }pintServerMonitorOBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { pintMib 2 }pintMibConformanceOBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { pintMib 3 } -- pintServerConfig - PINT configuration MIB variables pintReleaseNumber OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX SnmpAdminString MAX-ACCESS read-only STATUS current DESCRIPTION "An indication of version of the PINT protocol supported by this agent." ::= { pintServerConfig 1 } pintSysContact OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX SnmpAdminString MAX-ACCESS read-write STATUS current DESCRIPTION "Contact information related to the administration of the PINT services." ::= { pintServerConfig 2 } pintApplInstallPkgTable OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF PintApplInstallPkgEntry MAX-ACCESS not-accessible STATUS current DESCRIPTION "Table describing the PINT applications that are installed." ::= { pintServerConfig 3 } pintApplInstallPkgEntry OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX PintApplInstallPkgEntry MAX-ACCESS not-accessible STATUS current DESCRIPTION "Entries per PINT Application." AUGMENTS { sysApplInstallPkgEntry } ::= { pintApplInstallPkgTable 1 } PintApplInstallPkgEntry ::= SEQUENCE {

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 7]

```
pintApplInstallPkgDescription SnmpAdminString
pintApplInstallPkgDescription OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX SnmpAdminString
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Textual description of the installed PINT application."
    ::= { pintApplInstallPkgEntry 1 }
pintRegisteredGatewayTable OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF PintRegisteredGatewayEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
              current
   STATUS
   DESCRIPTION
    "Table describing the registered gateway applications."
    ::= { pintServerConfig 4 }
pintRegisteredGatewayEntry OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX PintRegisteredGatewayEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
   STATUS
          current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Entries per Registered Gateway Application."
AUGMENTS { sysApplInstallPkgEntry }
    ::= { pintRegisteredGatewayTable 1 }
PintRegisteredGatewayEntry ::= SEQUENCE {
pintRegisteredGatewayName SnmpAdminString,
pintRegisteredGatewayDescription SnmpAdminString
ł
pintRegisteredGatewayName OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX SnmpAdminString
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Name of the registered gateway."
    ::= { pintRegisteredGatewayEntry 1 }
pintRegisteredGatewayDescription OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX SnmpAdminString
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS
                current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Textual description of the registered gateway."
    ::= { pintRegisteredGatewayEntry 2 }
```

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 8]

-- pintServerMonitor - PINT monitoring statistics MIB variables pintServerGlobalPerfOBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= {pintServerMonitor 1 }pintServerClientPerfOBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= {pintServerMonitor 2 }pintServerUserIdPerfOBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= {pintServerMonitor 3 } pintServerGatewayPerf OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= {pintServerMonitor 4 } pintServerGlobalStatsTable OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF PintServerGlobalStatsEntry MAX-ACCESS not-accessible STATUS current DESCRIPTION "Table displaying the monitored global server statistics." ::= { pintServerGlobalPerf 1 } pintServerGlobalStatsEntry OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX PintServerGlobalStatsEntry MAX-ACCESS not-accessible STATUS current DESCRIPTION "Entries in the global statistics table. One entry is defined for each monitored service type and performance statistics collection period." INDEX {pintServerServiceTypeIndex, pintServerPerfStatPeriodIndex} ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsTable 1 } PintServerGlobalStatsEntry := SEQUENCE { pintServerServiceTypeIndex PintServiceType, pintServerPerfStatPeriodIndex PintPerfStatPeriod, Counter32, pintServerGlobalCallsReceived pintServerGlobalSuccessfulCalls Counter32, pintServerGlobalDisconnectedCalls Counter32, pintServerGlobalDisCUAutFCalls Counter32, pintServerGlobalDisServProbCalls Counter32, Counter32 pintServerGlobalDisGatProbCalls pintServerServiceTypeIndex OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX PintServiceType MAX-ACCESS not-accessible STATUS current DESCRIPTION "The unique identifier of the monitored service." ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 1 } pintServerPerfStatPeriodIndex OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX PintPerfStatPeriod MAX-ACCESS not-accessible

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 9]

```
STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Time period for which the performance statistics are requested
    from the pint server."
    ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 2 }
pintServerGlobalCallsReceived OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of received global calls."
    ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 3 }
pintServerGlobalSuccessfulCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of global successful calls."
    ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 4 }
pintServerGlobalDisconnectedCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of global disconnected (failed) calls."
    ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 5 }
pintServerGlobalDisCUAutFCalls
OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX Counter32
MAX-ACCESS read-only
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
   "Number of global calls that were disconnected because of client
   or user authorization failure."
::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 6 }
pintServerGlobalDisServProbCalls OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of global calls that were disconnected because of
    server problems."
    ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 7 }
```

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 10]

```
pintServerGlobalDisGatProbCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of global calls that were disconnected because of
    gateway problems."
    ::= { pintServerGlobalStatsEntry 8 }
pintServerClientStatsTable OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF PintServerClientStatsEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Table displaying the monitored server client statistics."
    ::= { pintServerClientPerf 1 }
pintServerClientStatsEntry OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX PintServerClientStatsEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
     "Entries in the client server statistics table.
    One entry is defined for each client identified by name,
    monitored service type and performance statistics collection
    period."
    INDEX {pintServerClientAddress, pintServerServiceTypeIndex,
    pintServerPerfStatPeriodIndex}
    ::= { pintServerClientStatsTable 1 }
PintServerClientStatsEntry := SEQUENCE {
pintServerClientAddress
                                                    SnmpAdminString,
pintServerClientCallsReceived
                                                      Counter32,
pintServerClientSuccessfulCalls
                                                      Counter32,
pintServerClientDisconnectedCalls
                                                      Counter32,
pintServerClientDisCAutFCalls
                                                      Counter32,
pintServerClientDisEFProbCalls
                                                      Counter32
pintServerClientAddress OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX SnmpAdminString
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "The unique identifier of the monitored client
    identified by its address represented as as a string."
    ::= { pintServerClientStatsEntry 1 }
```

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 11]

```
pintServerClientCallsReceived OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls received from the specific client."
    ::= { pintServerClientStatsEntry 2 }
pintServerClientSuccessfulCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls from the client successfully completed."
    ::= { pintServerClientStatsEntry 3 }
pintServerClientDisconnectedCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls received from the client, and that were
    disconnected (failed)."
    ::= { pintServerClientStatsEntry 4 }
pintServerClientDisCAutFCalls
OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX Counter32
MAX-ACCESS read-only
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
   "Number of calls from the client that were disconnected because of
   client authorization failure."
::= { pintServerClientStatsEntry 5 }
pintServerClientDisEFProbCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls from the client that were disconnected because
    of egress facility problems."
    ::= { pintServerClientStatsEntry 6 }
pintServerUserIdStatsTable
                             OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF PintServerUserIdStatsEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
   STATUS current
Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track
                                                             [Page 12]
```

DESCRIPTION "Table displaying the monitored Pint service user statistics." ::= { pintServerUserIdPerf 1 } pintServerUserIdStatsEntry OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX PintServerUserIdStatsEntry MAX-ACCESS not-accessible STATUS current DESCRIPTION "Entries in the user statistics table. One entry is defined for each user identified by name, each monitored service type and performance statistics collection period. It is assumed that the capabilities of the pint server are enough to accommodate the number of entries in this table. It is a local server implementation issue if an aging mechanism Is implemented in order to avoid scalability problems." INDEX {pintServerUserIdName, pintServerServiceTypeIndex, pintServerPerfStatPeriodIndex} ::= { pintServerUserIdStatsTable 1 } PintServerUserIdStatsEntry := SEQUENCE { pintServerUserIdName SnmpAdminString, pintServerUserIdCallsReceived Counter32, Counter32, pintServerUserIdSuccessfulCalls pintServerUserIdDisconnectedCalls Counter32, pintServerUserIdDiscUIdAFailCalls Counter32, pintServerUserIdEFProbCalls Counter32 } pintServerUserIdName OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX SnmpAdminString (SIZE(0..64)) MAX-ACCESS not-accessible STATUS current DESCRIPTION "The unique identifier of the monitored user identified by its name." ::= { pintServerUserIdStatsEntry 1 } pintServerUserIdCallsReceived OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX Counter32 MAX-ACCESS read-only STATUS current DESCRIPTION "Number of calls received from the specific user." ::= { pintServerUserIdStatsEntry 2 }

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 13]

```
pintServerUserIdSuccessfulCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls from the user successfully completed."
    ::= { pintServerUserIdStatsEntry 3 }
pintServerUserIdDisconnectedCalls OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls received from the user that were
    disconnected (failed)."
    ::= { pintServerUserIdStatsEntry 4 }
pintServerUserIdDiscUIdAFailCalls
OBJECT-TYPE
SYNTAX Counter32
MAX-ACCESS read-only
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls from the user that were disconnected because of
   user authorization failure."
::= { pintServerUserIdStatsEntry 5 }
pintServerUserIdEFProbCalls OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX Counter32
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
    "Number of calls from the user that were disconnected because of
    egress facility problems."
    ::= { pintServerUserIdStatsEntry 6 }
pintServerGatewayStatsTable OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF PintServerGatewayStatsEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
              current
    STATUS
   DESCRIPTION
    "Table displaying the monitored gateway statistics."
    ::= { pintServerGatewayPerf 1 }
pintServerGatewayStatsEntry OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX PintServerGatewayStatsEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
   STATUS current
```

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 14]

DESCRIPTION "Entries in the gateway table. One entry is defined for each gateway identified by name, each monitored service type and performance statistics collection period." INDEX { pintRegisteredGatewayName, pintServerServiceTypeIndex, pintServerPerfStatPeriodIndex } ::= { pintServerGatewayStatsTable 1 } PintServerGatewayStatsEntry ::= SEQUENCE { pintServerGatewayCallsReceived Counter32, pintServerGatewaySuccessfulCalls Counter32, pintServerGatewayDisconnectedCalls Counter32 } pintServerGatewayCallsReceived OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX Counter32 MAX-ACCESS read-only STATUS current DESCRIPTION "Number of calls received at the specified gateway." ::= { pintServerGatewayStatsEntry 1 } pintServerGatewaySuccessfulCalls OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX Counter32 MAX-ACCESS read-only STATUS current DESCRIPTION "Number of calls successfully completed at the specified gateway." ::= { pintServerGatewayStatsEntry 2 } pintServerGatewayDisconnectedCalls OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX Counter32 MAX-ACCESS read-only STATUS current DESCRIPTION "Number of calls that were disconnected (failed) at the specified gateway." ::= { pintServerGatewayStatsEntry 3 } - --- Notifications Section -- (none defined) _ _ -- Conformance Section

PINT MIB

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 15]

_ _ pintMibCompliances OBJECT IDENTIFIER :== { pintMibConformance 1 } OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { pintMibConformance 2 } pintMibGroups pintMibCompliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE STATUS current DESCRIPTION "Describes the requirements for conformance to the PINT MIB." MODULE -- this module MANDATORY-GROUPS { pintMibConfigGroup, pintMibMonitorGroup } ::= { pintMibCompliances 1 } pintMibConfigGroup OBJECT-GROUP OBJECTS { pintReleaseNumber, pintSysContact, pintApplInstallPkgDescription, pintRegisteredGatewayName, pintRegisteredGatewayDescription STATUS current DESCRIPTION "A collection of objects providing configuration information for a PINT Server." ::= { pintMibGroups 1 } pintMibMonitorGroup OBJECT-GROUP OBJECTS { pintServerGlobalCallsReceived, pintServerGlobalSuccessfulCalls, pintServerGlobalDisconnectedCalls, pintServerGlobalDisCUAutFCalls, pintServerGlobalDisServProbCalls, pintServerGlobalDisGatProbCalls, pintServerClientCallsReceived, pintServerClientSuccessfulCalls, pintServerClientDisconnectedCalls, pintServerClientDisCAutFCalls, pintServerClientDisEFProbCalls, --pintServerUserIdName, pintServerUserIdCallsReceived, pintServerUserIdSuccessfulCalls, pintServerUserIdDisconnectedCalls, pintServerUserIdDiscUIdAFailCalls, pintServerUserIdEFProbCalls,

```
pintServerGatewayCallsReceived,
pintServerGatewaySuccessfulCalls,
pintServerGatewayDisconnectedCalls
}
STATUS current
DESCRIPTION
    "A collection of objects providing monitoring
    information
    for a PINT Server."
::= { pintMibGroups 2 }
```

END

6. Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank Igor Faynberg for his encouragement to produce this work.

7. Security Considerations

There is only one management object defined in this MIB that has a MAX-ACCESS clause of read-write (pintSysContact). There are no read-create objects. This read-write object may be considered sensitive or vulnerable in some network environments. The support for SET operations in a non-secure environment without proper protection can have a negative effect on network operations.

There are a number of managed objects in this MIB that may contain information that may be sensitive from a business perspective. One could be the customer identification (UserIdName). Also information on PINT services performance might itself be need to be guarded. It is thus important to control even GET access to these objects and possibly to even encrypt the values of these object when sending them over the network via SNMP. Not all versions of SNMP provide features for such a secure environment.

SNMPv1 by itself is not a secure environment. Even if the network itself is secure (for example by using IPSec), even then, there is no control as to who on the secure network is allowed to access and GET/SET (read/change/create/delete) the objects in this MIB.

It is recommended that the implementers consider the security features as provided by the SNMPv3 framework. Specifically, the use of the User-based Security Model RFC 2574 [13] and the View-based Access Control Model RFC 2575 [16] is recommended.

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 17]

It is then a customer/user responsibility to ensure that the SNMP entity giving access to an instance of this MIB, is properly configured to give access to the objects only to those principals (users) that have legitimate rights to indeed GET or SET (change/create/delete) them.

8. IANA Considerations

All extensions to the values listed in this MIB must be done through Standards Action processes as defined in RFC 2434 [20].

9. Intellectual Property

The IETF takes no position regarding the validity or scope of any intellectual property or other rights that might be claimed to pertain to the implementation or use of the technology described in this document or the extent to which any license under such rights might or might not be available; neither does it represent that it has made any effort to identify any such rights. Information on the IETF's procedures with respect to rights in standards-track and standards-related documentation can be found in BCP-11. Copies of claims of rights made available for publication and any assurances of licenses to be made available, or the result of an attempt made to obtain a general license or permission for the use of such proprietary rights by implementors or users of this specification can be obtained from the IETF Secretariat.

The IETF invites any interested party to bring to its attention any copyrights, patents or patent applications, or other proprietary rights which may cover technology that may be required to practice this standard. Please address the information to the IETF Executive Director.

10. References

- [1] Lu, H., Conroy, L., Bellovin, S., Krishnaswamy, M., Burg, F., DeSimone, A., Tewani, K., Davidson, P., Schulzrinne, H. and K. Vishwanathan, "Toward the PSTN/Internet Inter-Networking --Pre-PINT Implementations", RFC 2458, November 1998.
- [2] Wijnen, B., Harrington, D. and R. Presuhn, "An Architecture for Describing SNMP Management Frameworks", RFC 2571, April 1999.
- [3] Rose, M. and K. McCloghrie, "Structure and Identification of Management Information for TCP/IP-based Internets", STD 16, RFC 1155, May 1990.

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 18]

- [4] Rose, M. and K. McCloghrie, "Concise MIB Definitions", STD 16, RFC 1212, March 1991.
- [5] Rose, M., "A Convention for Defining Traps for use with the SNMP", RFC 1215, March 1991.
- [6] McCloghrie, K., Perkins, D. and J. Schoenwaelder, "Structure of Management Information Version 2 (SMIv2)", STD 58, RFC 2578, April 1999.
- [7] McCloghrie, K., Perkins, D. and J. Schoenwaelder, "Textual Conventions for SMIv2", STD 58, RFC 2579, April 1999.
- [8] McCloghrie, K., Perkins, D. and J. Schoenwaelder, "Conformance Statements for SMIv2", STD 58, RFC 2580, April 1999.
- [9] Case, J., Fedor, M., Schoffstall, M. and J. Davin, "Simple Network Management Protocol", STD 15, RFC 1157, May 1990.
- [10] Case, J., McCloghrie, K., Rose, M. and S. Waldbusser, "Introduction to Community-based SNMPv2", RFC 1901, January 1996.
- [11] Case, J., McCloghrie, K., Rose, M. and S. Waldbusser, "Transport Mappings for Version 2 of the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMPv2)", RFC 1906, January 1996.
- [12] Case, J., Harrington D., Presuhn R. and B. Wijnen, "Message Processing and Dispatching for the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP)", RFC 2572, April 1999.
- [13] Blumenthal, U. and B. Wijnen, "User-based Security Model (USM) for version 3 of the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMPv3)", RFC 2574, April 1999.
- [14] Case, J., McCloghrie, K., Rose, M. and Waldbusser, "Protocol Operations for Version 2 of the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMPv2)", RFC 1905, January 1996.
- [15] Levi, D., Meyer, P. and B. Stewart, "SNMPv3 Applications", RFC 2573, April 1999.
- [16] Wijnen, B., Presuhn, R. and K. McCloghrie, "View-based Access Control Model (VACM) for the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP)", RFC 2575, April 1999.

Krishnaswamy & Romascanu Standards Track [Page 19]

- [17] Case, J., Mundy, R., Partain, D. and B. Stewart, "Introduction to Version 3 of the Internet-standard Network Management Framework", RFC 2570, April 1999.
- [18] Petrack, S. and L. Conroy, "The PINT Service Protocol: Extensions to SIP and SDP for IP Access to Telephone Call Services", RFC 2848, June 2000.
- [19] Krupczak, C. and J. Saperia, "Definitions of System-Level Managed Objects for Applications", RFC 2287, February 1998.
- [20] Narten, T. and H. Alvestrand, "Guidelines for Writing an IANA Considerations Section in RFCs", BCP 26, RFC 2434, October 1998.
- 11. Authors' Addresses

Murali Krishnaswamy Lucent Technologies 3C-512, 101 Crawfords Corner Rd. Holmdel, NJ 07733

Phone: +1 (732)949-3611 Fax: +1 (732)949-3210 EMail: murali@lucent.com

Dan Romascanu Avaya Communication Atidim Technology Park, Bldg 3 Tel Aviv, Israel

Phone: +972 3 6458414 EMail: dromasca@avaya.com

[Page 20]

12. Full Copyright Statement

Copyright (C) The Internet Society (2001). All Rights Reserved.

This document and translations of it may be copied and furnished to others, and derivative works that comment on or otherwise explain it or assist in its implementation may be prepared, copied, published and distributed, in whole or in part, without restriction of any kind, provided that the above copyright notice and this paragraph are included on all such copies and derivative works. However, this document itself may not be modified in any way, such as by removing the copyright notice or references to the Internet Society or other Internet organizations, except as needed for the purpose of developing Internet standards in which case the procedures for copyrights defined in the Internet Standards process must be followed, or as required to translate it into languages other than English.

The limited permissions granted above are perpetual and will not be revoked by the Internet Society or its successors or assigns.

This document and the information contained herein is provided on an "AS IS" basis and THE INTERNET SOCIETY AND THE INTERNET ENGINEERING TASK FORCE DISCLAIMS ALL WARRANTIES, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO ANY WARRANTY THAT THE USE OF THE INFORMATION HEREIN WILL NOT INFRINGE ANY RIGHTS OR ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE.

Acknowledgement

Funding for the RFC Editor function is currently provided by the Internet Society.

[Page 21]